

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, March 23, 2015 David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street 3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS: FRED SWEENEY, *Chair*

BRIAN MILLER, Vice-Chair

BERNI BERNSTEIN

LISA JAMES

JOSEPH MOTICHA JAIME PIERCE

DENISE WOOLERY

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (ALTERNATE): MIKE JORDAN

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor

DAVID ENG, Planning Technician

AMBER FLEMMINGS, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/SFDBVideos.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:01 p.m. by Chair Sweeney.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Sweeney, Miller (until 6:45 p.m.), Bernstein (until 5:50 p.m.) James, Moticha, and

Pierce (3:35 p.m.).

Members absent: Woolery.

Staff present: Limón, Eng, and Flemmings.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of March 9, 2015, as

amended.

Action: James/Bernstein, 4/0/1. Motion carried. (Sweeney abstained, Pierce/Woolery absent).

C. Consent Minutes:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Minutes of **March 16, 2015**. The Consent Minutes were reviewed by

James/Miller.

Action: Miller/James, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Pierce/Woolery absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Minutes of March 23, 2015. Item A was reviewed by James/Sweeney, and

Items B-D were reviewed by James/Miller.

Action: James/Moticha, 4/0/1. Motion carried. (Bernstein abstained, Pierce/Woolery absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

a. Chair Sweeney will step down from Item #1, 3626 San Remo Drive, and Item #4, 209 East Islay Street.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No Subcommittee Reports.

FINAL REVIEW

1. 3626 SAN REMO DR E-3/SD-2 Zone

(3:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-231-011

Application Number: MST2013-00506 Owner: Nancy J. Madsen Designer: Kate Svensson Applicant: Vincent Amore

(Lot 4: Proposal for construction of a two-story, 2,762 square foot, single-family residence and an attached, 498 square foot, two-car garage, located on a vacant 17,351 square foot parcel (Lot 4). The proposal includes associated flat work, landscaping, and site walls. This proposal is associated with a concurrent application (MST2009-00325) for a four (4) lot subdivision approved by Planning Commission on October 14, 2010 (Resolution No. 015-10). The proposed total of 3,260 square feet is 74% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Final Approval is requested. Project must comply with Planning Commission Resolution No. 022-14. Project was last reviewed on February 23, 2015.)

Actual time: 3:10 p.m.

Present: Vince Amore, Project Planner; Robert Adams, Landscape Architect; and

Kate Svensson, Designer.

Public comment opened at 3:15 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Final Approval as submitted with comments:

1) The Board finds that the applicant has responded with requested materials, colors, and

fixtures, and has provided a complete landscape plan.

Action: James/Moticha, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney stepped down, Pierce/Woolery absent).

2. 1215 E COTA ST R-2 Zone

(3:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-190-022

Application Number: MST2014-00310
Owner: Leslie Colasse
Architect: Leslie Colasse

(Proposal to demolish an existing one-car garage, mud room, and split-level bedroom at an existing 1,398 square foot two-level residence, and construct a new master suite with additions in the same location above a covered driveway. The proposal also includes a new 650 square foot three-car garage with an attached 300 square foot accessory structure, a kitchen remodel, and exterior improvements. The proposed total of 2,300 square feet on an 11,285 square foot lot is 59% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). This project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for an interior setback modification.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 071-14. Project was last reviewed on September 23, 2014.)

Actual time: 3:21 p.m.

Present: Leslie Colasse, Architect and Owner.

Public comment opened at 3:38 p.m.

1) Trevor Martinson, representative for the adjacent neighbor at 1217 E. Cota, expressed concerns regarding the Staff Hearing Officer's approval of the interior setback modification for portions of the residence that were alleged to have been unpermitted. He also noted that the design of the proposed project violated City parking standards for driveway width.

The Board acknowledged a letter of expressed concerns from Trevor Martinson regarding the granting of a zoning modification to allegedly unpermitted portions of the residence. The letter also noted inconsistencies with the project as it relates to City parking standards and suggested an alternative location for that garage and accessory building to preserve his client's subset views.

Public comment closed at 3:40 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Full Board with

comments:

1) The Board appreciates the quality and style of the architecture.

- 2) The Board supports the height and scale of the tower element, but requests further study of the ornamental screen detailing.
- 3) The Board supports the location of the garage near the back of the rear yard as submitted on Sheet A.12.
- 4) The Board can support the height and scale of the garage, finding it consistent per the Design Guidelines on page 20-C.
- 5) It is not in the Board's purview to regulate private views.
- 6) It is not in the Board's purview to make decisions on whether or not a building is permitted.
- 7) The Board notes that privacy issues were not raised during the review of the project.

Action: Miller/James, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Woolery absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

3. 324 SHERMAN RD A-1 Zone

(4:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-050-006

Application Number: MST2015-00003

Owner: Appelbaum-Shapiro Living Trust

Designer: Amy Von Protz

Applicant: Vanguard Planning, LLC

(Proposal to construct a new 2,301 square foot, two-story, single-family residence with an attached 419 square foot, two-car garage, and a 283 square feet of raised wood decks. The proposal will replace a 1,775 square foot residence and 422 two-car garage that were destroyed in the Tea Fire. The proposed total of 2,720 square feet on a 14,395 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 64% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications to allow additions in the front and interior setbacks.)

(Second concept review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)

Actual time: 4:29 p.m.

Present: Jarrett Gorin, Applicant; and Amy Von Protz, Designer.

Public comment opened at 4:42 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer to return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the redesign and the applicant's sensitivity to the Board's comments.
- 2) The Board supports the front and interior setbacks as aesthetically appropriate and finds that both modifications do not pose consistency issues with the Design Guidelines.
- 3) Study the window proportions, specifically near the stairwell.
- 4) Provide an arborist report concerning the deck, near the oak tree.
- 5) The Board can support the outdoor staircase if it is also acceptable to the Staff Hearing Officer.

Action: Bernstein/Moticha, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Woolery absent).

^{*} THE BOARD RECESSED AT 5:00 P.M. AND RECONVENED AT 5:07 P.M. *

4. 209 E ISLAY ST E-1 Zone

(4:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-042-009

Application Number: MST2014-00114 Owner: Peter Camenzind

Applicant: Vanguard Planning LLC

Architect: Doug Leach
Landscape Architect: Suding Design

(Proposal to demolish an existing 3,817 square foot, two-story, single-family residence and detached garage and construct a new 5,792 square foot, two-story, single-family residence with a 719 square foot attached three-car garage, and 2,843 square foot habitable basement below grade. The project includes a new 25 square foot detached pool building, relocated driveway, reconfiguration of the site walls in the front yard, and new landscaping throughout. The proposed total of 9,379 square feet of development, of which 5,817 square feet is above grade, is on a 23,870 square foot lot is 123% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Project must comply with Tier 3 SWMP and meet 3-Star rating for Santa Barbara Built Green prior to Final Approval. Project was last reviewed on November 3, 2014.)

Actual time: 5:07 p.m.

Present: Jarrett Gorin, Applicant; Doug Leach, Architect; and Peter Camenzind, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:30 p.m.

1) Cheri Rae spoke in opposition of the project concerning the demolition of historic homes in the Upper East, and the excessive FAR and proposed grading. She suggested the home be scaled down to an allowable FAR and that the applicant reconsider reconfiguring the existing stone wall.

Letters of expressed concerns from Cheri Rae, Kellam de Forest, and Penelope Davies were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:37 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with comments:

1) The Board finds that the proposed development is consistent with the scenic character of the City, compatible with the neighborhood, that its size, bulk, and scale are acceptable, and the quality of architecture is exceptional.

Action: Pierce/Moticha, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney stepped down, Woolery absent).

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

5. 1409 LA CIMA RD R-1 Zone

(5:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-010-025 Application Number: MST2014-00613

Owner: Christopher Joseph Brown

Designer: Erick Rojas

(Proposal to permit 208.5 linear feet of an "as-built" 6-foot tall, wood fence located along the southern property line and replace portions of an existing 6-foot tall wood fence located along the northern and western property lines. The proposal will address violations identified in enforcement case ENF2014-01057.)

(Second concept review. Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Project was referred to Full Board from Consent on December 22, 2014.)

Actual time: 5:50 p.m.

Present: Amy Blakemore, Landscape Architect; and, Naj and Chris Brown, Owners.

Public comment opened at 6:08 p.m.

- 1) Margie Manquist, adjacent neighbor, spoke in opposition of the fence, quoting the Single Family Design Guidelines concerning neighborhood compatibility and Good Neighbor Guidelines. She was concerned the fence had been built without permits and public knowledge, and that her privacy and views had been diminished.
- 2) Alan Scholl, adjacent neighbor, expressed concerns regarding the height and scale of the fence. He stated the fence as being "unacceptable" and "non-transparent" regarding its visibility throughout the neighborhood.
- 3) Bonna Hamilton, neighbor at 1415 La Cima Road, expressed concerns regarding neighborhood compatibility and Good Neighbor Guidelines. She stated that as a result of the height of the fence, panoramic views were lost, and it should have been communicated to the neighbors.
- 4) Gowdy Misson, neighbor at 1484 La Cima Road, spoke in support of the project.
- 5) David Fainer, attorney representing Margie Manquist, expressed concerns regarding the berm created by the production of the fence. He suggested that a site visit be conducted to fully understand the severity of the fence and its disturbance to the neighborhood. He stated that the fence was too high and in conflict with similar structures, and it disrupted the views of the surrounding neighbors.

Letters of expressed concerns from Charles and Denise Judd, Deborah Kovanda, and Robert A. Sowins, D.D.S. were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 6:22 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

1) An organized site visit will be conducted at the next Full Board hearing.

Action: Pierce/Moticha, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein/Woolery absent).

6. 430 EL CIELITO RD A-1 Zone

(5:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-073-009 Application Number: MST2014-00540

Owner: Dennis Artuian Revocable Trust

Architect: Peter Becker Architect

Contractor: Rick Jeffrey
Architect: Jacob Niksto

(Proposal to demolish an existing 53 square foot sunroom and an 87 gross square foot pool equipment shed, and construct 584 square feet of residential additions, comprising a 185 square foot addition to the dwelling and the conversion of 399 square feet of an existing carport to habitable space. The project includes construction of an attached 1,128 square foot two-level four-car garage and a detached 70 square foot pool equipment/sauna building to the existing one-story, 1,974 square foot, single-family residence. It also includes three new uncovered guest parking spaces, 225 cubic yards of cut and fill grading, reconfiguring the existing driveway, new site walls, and landscaping alterations, including the removal of two trees (one 8-inch oak tree and a 12-inch liquid amber tree). The proposed development total of 3,813 square feet, located on a 31,356 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District, is 79% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The proposal includes Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification to exceed the allowed garage size. The application will address the violation identified in the Zoning Information Report ZIR2013-00604.)

(Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Compliance with Tier 3 SWMP required prior to Final Approval. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 003-15. Project was last reviewed on November 17, 2014.)

Actual time: 6:30 p.m.

Present: Peter Becker, Architect; Jacob Niksto, Project Architect; and

Amy Blakemore, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:38 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the applicant's efforts in complying with Board requests.
- 2) The Board approves the changes to the grille work, stepping down the height of the retaining wall, and oak trees mitigation measures.
- 3) The proposed development is consistent in appearance and is compatible with the scenic character of the City, the quality of architecture is superior, the tree mitigation is acceptable, and the project complies with the Good Neighbor Guidelines.

Action: James/Miller, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein/Woolery absent).

7. 550 OWEN RD A-2 Zone

(6:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-202-027 Application Number: MST2014-00578

Owner: William Z., Jr. and Emily K. Kerr Trustees

Architect: Pacific Architects, Inc. Engineer: Kevin Vandervort

(Proposal to demolish the existing one-story, 2,581 square foot, single-family residence and detached garage, and construct a new two-story, 4,281 square foot single-family residence, including an attached three-car garage and storage area. The proposed new residence will be built within the existing building foundation footprint. The proposal involves approximately 230 cubic yards of grading site improvements, the removal of approximately 2,350 square feet of existing driveway area, and new site landscaping. The proposed total of 4,281 square feet, located on a 1.92 acre lot in the Hillside Design District, is 78% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Project requires Tier 3 SWMP compliance prior to Final Approval. Project was last reviewed on December 15, 2014.)

Actual time: 7:09 p.m.

Present: Bill Wolf, Architect; and Sam Mathis, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 7:22 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued two weeks to the Consent with comments:

- 1) Provide a completed landscape plan.
- 2) The proposed development is consistent in appearance with the scenic character of the City, the size, bulk, and scale is acceptable and compatible with the neighborhood, and the quality of architecture is appropriate.
- 3) The fireplace chimney and the windows on the south elevation are acceptable.

Action: Pierce/James, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein/Miller/Woolery absent).

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

8. 350 MOUNTAIN DR A-1 Zone

(7:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-012-023

Application Number: MST2015-00043 Owner: Ruth Engle

Applicant: Steve Willson

(Proposal for 702 gross square feet of one- and second-story additions to an existing 2,821 square foot, two-story single-family residence with an attached two-car garage. The proposed total of 3,523 gross square feet on a 1-acre lot in the Hillside Design District is 71% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Second concept review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on February 23, 2015.)

Actual time: 7:30 p.m.

Present: Steve Willson, Applicant.

Public comment opened at 7:37 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued two weeks to Consent with

comments:

1) Provide a full set of drawings and details.

2) The applicant addressed the exterior metal siding, cut sheets for dark sky compliant lighting fixtures and the locations on the elevations, the color board and materials, details of the overhang and deck railings, and the details of the garage doors.

Action: James/Moticha, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein/Miller/Woolery absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:40 P.M. **

A-1/SD-3 Zone

CONSENT AGENDA (11:00 A.M.)

Items on Consent Agenda were reviewed by Lisa James and Brian Miller.

NEW ITEM – PUBLIC HEARING

A. 3511 SEA LEDGE LN

Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-082-003 Application Number: MST2015-00097

Owner: David Roark and Sherrie Anderson

Applicant: Brian Miller

(Proposal to demolish a 280 square foot, attached, one-car carport and construct a new 400 square foot, attached, two-car garage to an existing one-story 3,363 square foot single-family residence. The residence includes an existing 300 square foot accessory space and 252 square foot, one-car garage in a detached building. The project will result in a total of three covered parking spaces. The proposal also includes permitting an "as-built" trellis over the rear patio, exterior window and door alterations, the removal of an unpermitted shower in the accessory building, and an interior remodel of the master bathroom and closet. The proposed total of 4,230 square feet of development on a 1.15 acre lot in the Hillside Design District and the appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone is 84% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). This project includes Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit. This project will address building violations identified in Zoning Information Report ZIR2015-00016.)

(Comments only; project requires an environmental assessment and Planning Commission Review for a Coastal Development Permit.)

Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission to return to Consent with comment:

1) The proposal is aesthetically appropriate and does not pose consistency issues with the Design Guidelines.

FINAL REVIEW

B. 614 SIERRA ST R-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-404-004
Application Number: MST2015-00080
Owner: Collins Financial, LLC

Architect: Larry Clark

(Proposal to for a 60 square foot ground-floor addition to an existing 985 square foot single-family residence with an attached 400 square foot two-car garage in the Hillside Design District.)

(Final Approval is requested.)

Final Approval as submitted.

NEW ITEM

C. 1865 STANWOOD DR

A-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-141-034
Application Number: MST2015-00125
Owner: Jeffrey Jones
Applicant: Don Gragg
Architect: Michelle Lang

(Proposal for partial demolition and reconstruction of an existing detached accessory building which was destroyed in the Tea Fire. The original building was approximately 900 square feet. The proposed new building will be a maximum of 500 square feet. The primary residence was approved in 2012 and is currently under construction. The onsite development, located on a 3.65 acre lot in the Hillside Design District, is 58% of the guideline maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project was postponed one week.

NEW ITEM

D. 1912 MISSION RIDGE RD

A-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-083-021 Application Number: MST2015-00133 Owner: Craig Morrison

(Proposal for a hot tub and raised wooden platform in the rear yard of an existing single-family residence in the Hillside Design District.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project was continued one week to Consent with comment:

1) Show the grade and neighbor's wall to the north of the proposed spa on elevation plans.